

2015



UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF MEDICINE

***OPERATIONS MANUAL OF
THE FACULTY
APPOINTMENTS ADVISORY
COMMITTEE (FAAC)***

Revised December 2015

FACULTY APPOINTMENTS ADVISORY COMMITTEE, FACULTY OF MEDICINE

The Faculty Appointments Advisory Committee (FAAC) advises the Dean on (1) initial appointments at professorial ranks for full-time clinical (MD) and status-only faculty where a University approved search has not been carried out, and (2) on full-time clinical (MD) faculty promotions from lecturer to assistant professor. The FAAC reviews applications from the three sectors of the Faculty of Medicine:

- Basic Sciences
- Clinical
- Rehabilitation Sciences

This document describes the FAAC in two sections:

- Section A: FAAC terms of reference
- Section B: Procedures and key processes related to the FAAC, including application requirements and standards for rank

FAAC is administered by Human Resources, Faculty of Medicine, University of Toronto.

SECTION A

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Purpose of the FAAC

The FAAC advises the Dean on:

1. Appointments of full-time clinical (MD) faculty and status-only faculty to professorial ranks where a formal search was not carried out as constituted under University of Toronto and Faculty of Medicine policies and guidelines (*Note Appendix A: Formal Search and Hiring procedures*). Applications must clearly indicate if a formal search was held or not.
2. Academic rank of candidate for appointment;
3. Promotion of full-time clinical (MD) faculty from lecturer to assistant professor
4. Academic appointment and promotion processes and standards;
5. Appointments and promotions referred to FAAC by the Dean or Dean's delegate where the FAAC opinion is requested;
6. Category change at professorial rank from part-time or adjunct clinical (MD), to full-time clinical (MD).

Note: Appointments Not Reviewed by FAAC

All other clinical (MD) appointment applications (i.e., following a search; at lecturer rank; and/or part-time clinical academic and adjunct clinical academic appointments) are submitted to the Dean or Dean's designate directly for review and approval, without being submitted to the FAAC for review.

Authority

Clinical (MD) academic appointments are governed by the *Policy for Clinical Faculty and Procedures Manual*, available at: <http://medicine.utoronto.ca/faculty-staff/clinical-affairs>

All other appointments are governed by the University of Toronto *Policy and Procedures on Academic Appointments*, available at: <http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/policies/phoct302003i.htm>

Tasks

The FAAC performs a review of each application submitted by the department chair or applicable academic head, applying faculty and sector-specific contexts to judge fairly and consistently the merits of the application. Members do not simply approve applications that meet a set of minimum standards; they must draw on their knowledge and experience to evaluate meritorious scholarship, consistent with principles expressed in this and other documents related to academic appointments and promotions. Decisions to accept or reject applications, achieved by consensus or vote, are recommended to the Dean. If the FAAC requires further information, the application is deferred and a request for new information is made to the department chair. A deferred application will be kept open for a maximum of two months, after which the file is closed unless there are extraordinary circumstances communicated to Human

Resources. After the file has been closed, the department chair may submit a new application with updated information, for full review by the FAAC.

Each FAAC member should declare any conflict so that Committee members understand the relationships. Members who have published, or received or written grants in the previous five years, or had a supervisory and/or mentorship relationship at any time with the candidate should not participate in the FAAC deliberation or decision about that application. A FAAC member who feels that he/she has a conflict for other reasons should withdraw from participation when the file is discussed.

Appointment Review - Appeals

The department chair or applicable academic head may submit an appeal to the Dean on the FAAC's recommendation on an application. A full-time clinical (MD) appointee may appeal a rejection of promotion from Lecturer to Assistant Professor, according to the procedures set out in the Faculty of Medicine *Promotions Manual* and *Procedures Manual for Policy for Clinical Faculty*. This must be done within two months of the FAAC's recommendation to the Dean.

Members

The Dean appoints seven members to the FAAC, including a Chair, with representation from each of the three sectors (Basic Sciences, Clinical and Rehabilitation Sciences).

Each Committee member normally serves a three-year term, with appointments staggered to ensure consistency and continuity over time. The Chair of the FAAC is appointed by the Dean. The Faculty of Medicine Human Resources and Clinical Affairs offices provide support to the FAAC.

Meetings

The FAAC meets approximately once per month, usually in person. Electronic deliberation on line may be used instead, as warranted. The Chair and the FAAC members determine meeting dates and agenda items for discussion in consultation with Human Resources.

Human Resources staff in the Faculty of Medicine set the deadlines for submission of material from the departments for each FAAC meeting. When urgent unforeseen circumstances arise, FAAC will review an appointment application off cycle on a case by case basis at the discretion of the FAAC Chair.

All documents, deliberations and decisions of FAAC are strictly confidential. Anyone seeking information on FAAC may consult Human Resources or the FAAC chair.

Review of Terms and Procedures

The FAAC reviews the FAAC Terms of Reference and Procedures normally every three years, and revises where necessary, in consultation with the All Chairs and Clinical Relations Committees as appropriate. The Dean approves revisions and these are reported to Faculty Council for information.

Reporting

1. After each FAAC meeting, recommendations on each request for appointment or promotion are reported to the Dean.
2. Annual aggregate reports of appointment approvals/deferrals is reported to the Clinical Relations Committee, All Chairs Committee, Faculty Council, and Toronto Academic Health Sciences Network (TAHSN) Medical Affairs Subcommittee.
3. When an initial Status Only appointment at the rank of full professor is recommended by FAAC and approved by the Dean it must be reported to the Provost for approval.

SECTION B PROCEDURES, APPLICATION REQUIREMENTS AND STANDARDS FOR RANK

1. Clinical (MD) Appointments and Promotions

Clinical (MD) faculty appointments: definition and categories

Clinical (MD) faculty refers to an individual (or individuals) licensed to practice medicine in Ontario, who holds a medical staff appointment in a Hospital or other clinical site affiliated with the University; or, less often, in a community clinic, industry or private practice; and has a University appointment in a clinical department in the Faculty of Medicine. The categories of clinical faculty appointment are:

- Full-time clinical – participates in a practice plan or equivalent arrangement; engages in academic activities¹ for at least 80% of professional time; holds an active medical staff or equivalent appointment at an affiliated site.
- Part-time clinical – engages in academic activities for at least 20% but less than 80%, of professional time; holds a medical staff appointment at an affiliated site.
- Adjunct clinical – engaged in academic activities for less than 20% of professional time; or does not hold a medical staff appointment at an affiliated site.
- Visiting – a physician from another university or research institute who holds a continuing appointment at his/her home institution.

Note: Clinical (MD) faculty appointed in the full-time clinical academic and part-time clinical academic appointment categories must have an academic position description.

Initial Appointment at the Rank of Assistant Professor

An initial appointment at the rank of Assistant Professor requires the successful completion of a recognized graduate program or an advanced training experience deemed to be equivalent to a Master's level program. In some cases, one to two years

¹ Academic activities: teaching (including provision of clinical care that may involve supervision of trainees), research, creative professional activity, and academic administration or work that supports directly academic work by other clinical faculty [Procedures Manual for Policy for Clinical Faculty, 2013].

of fellowship training, including secondary level resident training will be considered the equivalent to an advanced degree. Normally, the degree program must have been completed as documented by a successful defense of a thesis and awarding of the degree before submission of the request for appointment. Normally the thesis results in at least one first authored scholarly publication in a high quality peer reviewed journal. In some cases in which the candidate is enrolled part-time in graduate studies, the FAAC may advise an exception to the requirement for completion of the degree program, if the Department Chair includes a justification for special consideration as part of the application.²

It is expected that the candidate will have at least one or two published (or accepted) first authored peer-reviewed publications in well regarded journals in their field at the time of request for appointment, excluding case reports, editorials, letters to editor, book reviews, **OR** documentation clearly demonstrating educational accomplishments that includes convincing evidence of one or more of the following:

- 1) Sustained teaching excellence (i.e., a summary of a strong teaching dossier that includes: i) analysis of student/trainee evaluations with comparisons against peer teachers; ii) numbers and types of trainees and evidence that the candidate has taught in a variety of teaching environments; and iii) teaching awards).
- 2) Design and development of curricula, educational offerings and/or educational materials.
- 3) Creative Professional Activity (CPA) in teaching/education (such as the setting of practice standards). Evidence and impact of CPA must be provided.

Impact of scholarship at local or regional levels should be demonstrated.

Generally, advanced training and publications should be sufficiently recent and related to current work, to show some continuity of academic accomplishment to the present. Other evidence of academic achievement, such as research funding, academic positions, patents and invited lectures are considered.

In situations where the applicant has completed fellowship training deemed to be equivalent to a Master's level program, and is enrolled currently in a graduate studies program, the appointment normally will be as lecturer until completion of that degree program, though the FAAC may grant an exception as described above.

Enrolment in full-time graduate studies normally precludes initiation of a full-time clinical academic appointment, irrespective of rank.

The applicant's academic position description will be reviewed for appropriateness and to ensure sign-off by the department chair, hospital chief, and applicant. As a statement

² E.g. the FAAC may approve at assistant professor an applicant with a previously-completed Master's or equivalent, and sufficient scholarly achievement, to have met the assistant professor standard without completion of further graduate study.

of expectation rather than past achievement, generally the academic position description does not influence the standard for academic rank (e.g. the standard for assistant professor is equivalent for a clinician scientist and a clinician teacher).

Lateral Transfer of Assistant Professor Rank

Applications from candidates who hold an appointment at the rank of assistant professor at another university will be reviewed by FAAC to ensure that they meet Faculty of Medicine standards for appointment at the rank of assistant professor. If the candidate does not meet the required standards, appointment will be made at the rank of lecturer.

Initial Appointment or Lateral Transfer at Rank of Associate or Full Professor

Applications from candidates, who hold appointments at ranks of associate or full professor at other universities, or appointments at universities that use different ranking systems, will be reviewed by the FAAC to ensure that they meet the Faculty of Medicine standards for the requested rank. An outline of the criteria can be found in the Faculty of Medicine's *Manual for Promotion*, available at:

<http://medicine.utoronto.ca/sites/default/files/ManualforAcademicPromotion2015.pdf>

Promotion at Time of Initial Appointment

At initial appointment, the FAAC will not approve a request for promotion in rank above an applicant's highest rank held currently or previously at another university or the University of Toronto. Applications for promotion at the time of initial appointment must be directed by the Department Chair to the Dean on the recommendation of the Department Promotions Committee. If the applicant comes from a university that uses a different terminology to identify rank that differs from the University of Toronto, the application should be directed to the FAAC.

Resumption of Former Rank

On resumption or re-institution of a faculty appointment, the applicant's rank will not be lower than the rank held formerly.

Promotion from Lecturer to Assistant Professor

Full-time clinical (MD) faculty members who hold an appointment as lecturer may be considered for promotion at any time that they meet the requirements as set out above for an initial appointment at the rank of assistant professor. There are no set timelines, but generally, for the criterion of sustained teaching excellence, the application should demonstrate sustained contributions and scholarship in the Faculty of Medicine for at least three years.

Documents Required for Application for Initial Clinical Appointment

Initial requests for a full-time clinical (MD) appointment require the following documents to be submitted to the FAAC:

- application for clinical (MD) academic appointment form signed by the department chair

- updated curriculum vitae³
- academic position description
- Certificate of Professional Conduct from the College of Physician and Surgeons of Ontario
- draft offer of academic appointment letter (unsigned)
- letter of support from the department chair
- letter of support from the chair of the Department Appointments Committee (DAC), or explanatory excerpt from DAC meeting minutes (including evaluation of teaching dossier and the rationale to justify request for rank must be stated clearly and explicitly rather than assumed)
- intra-departmental letters of reference (2-3), where applicable
- extra-departmental letters of reference (2-3) where applicable. In some cases only intra-departmental letters may be available, then 3-4 letters will be required
(extra-departmental letters of reference are those provided in support of the candidate's application from departments other than the university department where the candidate holds the appointment)

Documents Required for Application for Promotion of a Current Full-Time Clinical (MD) Faculty Member from Lecturer to Assistant Professor:

- lecturer to assistant professor promotion application form
- updated curriculum vitae **see footnote 3*
- academic position description
- copy of the initial offer of academic appointment letter
- letter of support from the department chair/if applicable letter of support from cross appointed chair
- letter of support from the chair of the Department Appointments Committee or Department Promotions Committee, or excerpt from minutes of meeting (including evaluation of teaching dossier)
- intra-departmental or extra-departmental letters of reference (2)

³ Preferably in Faculty of Medicine WebCV format CV must be in chronological order. Education section must distinguish accurately Royal College or equivalent residency from fellowship training. All claims that grants or articles are "peer-review" must be accurate. CV, Department Chair letter or DAC Chair letter must explain teaching award significance e.g. size of competition pool, and explain journal article significance, such as journal impact factor, citations.

2. Status Only –Appointments

Definition

Status-only University appointees are employed outside of the University, usually by an academic/research institution and normally receive no remuneration from the University of Toronto. Such appointments are made to allow an individual faculty member to participate more fully in a university department's teaching or research program. Status-only appointments do not fall under the Faculty of Medicine's *the Policy for Clinical Faculty* Individuals being considered for a status-only appointment normally hold full-time employment arrangements with another institution with a job description that is primarily academic (research and teaching) in nature. For those in hospitals and research institutes, appointees generally hold similar qualifications and fulfill similar research responsibilities as professorial faculty at the University. FAAC considers the type of appointment at the institution, the type of employment arrangement with the institution and the availability of independent space and resources to carry out research. The appointment is for independent scientists and those who have regular and on-going involvement in the teaching and evaluation of learners. . As is the case at the University, Research Associates are not eligible for status only professional appointments to the Faculty of Medicine. The position of status only is to be aligned with an equivalent position at the university.

<http://www.aapm.utoronto.ca/status-only-adjunct-and-visiting-professors>

In the rehabilitation sector, status only faculty may be primarily appointed to participate in the provision of teaching and education.

Appointment at the Rank of Instructor/Lecturer

Initial status-only appointments at the rank of Instructor/Lecturer are not subject to review by the FAAC, but are submitted to the Dean for approval. A status only faculty appointed at the rank of Lecturer cannot be considered for promotion. Instead, should a department chair determine that an individual has become qualified for appointment at the rank of Assistant Professor, the department must submit a new application to the FAAC.

Appointment at the Rank of Assistant Professor

An initial status-only appointment at the rank of Assistant Professor requires the successful completion of a doctoral program or other scholarly or professional work deemed to be equivalent.

Applicants with a PhD must show evidence of scholarly productivity. Scholarship should include a post-doctoral fellowship, first-authored peer-reviewed publications. In addition, national speaking engagements, invited lectures, and sustained excellent contributions to a teaching program, including curriculum development will be considered.

Individuals in health care settings⁴ who have completed a Master's level program will be considered for an appointment at the rank of Assistant Professor where there is clear documented evidence of a strong record of scholarly achievement and/or creative professional activity in line with departmental norms such as:

- a history of relevant experience involving graduate level teaching;
- coordination of a significant component of the curriculum including any of the following; classroom lectures, presentations, small group facilitation, supervision of graduate research projects, and involvement in the organization or planning of the evaluation components of the curriculum;
- positive evaluations from students;
- published work including monographs, reports, articles and reviews in which the candidate has contributed to the advancement of knowledge as a result of his/her work;
- contributed innovations in techniques or concepts that have an important influence on the discipline's practice including teaching;
- presentation of peer reviewed scholarly papers or posters at professional and/or scientific meetings or participating as a panel member at such meetings;
- principal or co-investigator/co-supervisor for a research project;
- involvement in the planning of major research initiatives – e.g. planning or coordinating research symposia;
- collaborative research with faculty members;
- evidence of instructional innovation and/or creative excellence;
- contributed innovations (with documentation) in techniques or concepts that have an important influence on the discipline's practice;
- registrant in good standing of a provincial/national regulatory body.

Lateral Transfers

Applications from candidates who hold an appointment at the rank of Assistant Professor at another university will be reviewed by FAAC to ensure that they meet Faculty of Medicine standards for the rank of Assistant Professor.

Initial Appointment at Rank of Associate or Full Professor

Applications from candidates who hold an appointment at the rank of Associate or Full Professor at another university will be reviewed by FAAC to ensure that they meet the Faculty of Medicine standards for the requested rank. An outline of the criteria can be found in the Faculty of Medicine's *Manual for Promotion*, available at:

<http://medicine.utoronto.ca/sites/default/files/ManualforAcademicPromotion2015.pdf>

Promotion on Appointment from Another University

Requests for promotion at the time of initial status only appointment must be directed by the Department Chair or applicable academic head to the Dean on the recommendation of the Department Promotions Committee. The Dean will consult with

⁴ This would include individuals working in the rehabilitation sector and those performing teaching and research in specific Master of Science Programs, for example, Genetic Counseling. It does not include physicians covered under the Policy for Clinical Faculty.

the Chair of the Decanal Promotions Committee who will review the application with selected members of the decanal committee. This is done to ensure equity in promotion between existing and new faculty. This review takes place electronically.

Application Requirements

Initial requests for a status only appointment require:

- application for Status-Only (non-MD) Academic Appointment Form signed by the Department Chair
- updated Curriculum Vitae - must be in the Faculty of Medicine Standard WebCV format available at: <http://medicine.utoronto.ca/faculty-staff/faculty-appointments-and-promotions>
- statement of research or teaching, if available
- draft offer of status-only University appointment letter (unsigned)
- letter of support from the department Chair, which must include deliberations of the Department Appointments Committee, as well as clear rationale for the appointment and the rank requested, supported by documentary evidence, such as teaching dossier
- intradepartmental letters of reference (2-3), where applicable
- extra-departmental letters of reference (2-3) where applicable, in some cases only intra-departmental letters may be available, then 3-4 letters will be required. (extra-departmental letters of reference are those provided in support of the candidate's application from departments other than the university department where the candidate holds the appointment)
- letter from employing institute permitting status-only academic appointment at the University of Toronto. If the candidate has PhD Scientist designation, or equivalent this letter must come from the appropriate VP of Research at the hospital or research institution where the scientist is employed, confirming that the hospital or research institution will provide salary and lab facilities for the duration of the faculty appointment
- if the request for an initial appointment is at the rank of associate or full professor, external referee letters (3) assessing the candidate's national and international scholarly impact should be submitted

APPENDIX A: Formal Search and Hiring Procedures

This is for information purposes only as appointments with a formal search are sent by Human Resources directly to the Dean and are not reviewed by the FAAC.

Definition of a Formal Search for Clinical (MD) and Status Only Faculty

Applications for an appointment at the rank of full-time clinical (MD) assistant professor or above, or a status-only appointment at the rank of assistant professor and above, do not require review by FAAC where there is a formal search. A formal search includes a **search committee** with at least one University of Toronto representative at a professorial rank, **broad advertising** to reach potential applicants and effective **interviewing and evaluating** techniques as outlined in the Academic Appointments Procedures Manual http://www.aapm.utoronto.ca/recruitment#_Toc309136693 Applications that involve a formal search are sent directly to the Dean of the Faculty of Medicine for approval. Applications at the rank of full professor (status only) also require provostial approval.

SEARCH PROCESS

Search Committee

The creation of the search committee for full-time clinical academic appointments should be a joint effort between the affiliated hospital and the University of Toronto. The composition of the search committee is extremely important because it sets the tone for the search and the success of the recruitment process. It also presents the face of the University department and hospital. The search committee should strive for diversity in membership. Members should be knowledgeable about the future direction of the department; have a proven track record of good judgment about people; and be representative of the breadth and depth of the discipline.

When initiating the search process, the search committee must determine the general scope of the position and identify the skills, experience, qualifications, knowledge and attributes a candidate will need to successfully perform in the position. The search committee should determine the criteria that prospective candidates need to meet in order to be considered for the shortlist, the interview, and the position.

Advertising

The purpose of the advertisement is to reach the largest possible pool of qualified applicants and fulfill the requirement by Employment and Social Development Canada (ESDC) that academic positions be advertised in such a way that qualified Canadians and permanent residents have the opportunity to learn of the vacancy. The Faculty of Medicine HR Office reviews and approves all positions posted on the University's career site *which includes an automatic posting in Inside Higher Ed*. Additional advertising mediums include national and international disciplinary journals and corresponding

medical schools in other Canadian universities. It is also good practice to use personal and professional networks, contacts, and recommendations to seek leads to candidates from designated groups (women, visible minorities, aboriginal peoples, and persons with a disability); and encourage all members of the department to make recruitment part of their activities at conferences and national and international meetings.

When drafting the advertisement, the search committee should try to use inclusive language, advertise for excellent scholarship, identify a range of disciplines or inter-discipline areas and include emerging areas of scholarship. Details should include position, rank, responsibilities and summary of essential duties, degrees required or preferred, experience or qualifications required or preferred, date of appointment, location of work, application materials, closing date (which is at least one month after publication), and contact details. All advertisements must contain the following statements:

The University of Toronto is strongly committed to diversity within its community and especially welcomes applications from visible minority group members, women, Aboriginal persons, persons with disabilities, members of sexual minority groups, and others who may contribute to the further diversification of ideas.

All qualified candidates are encouraged to apply; however, Canadians and permanent residents will be given priority.

The posting may also include a description of the University of Toronto department and hospital. It is important to advertise broadly within the applicable specialty area. Ideally, the search process should not be closed until a candidate pool of sufficient diversity has been attained.

Please refer to the ESDC site to ensure that all federal government advertising requirements are also met:

http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/jobs/foreign_workers/higher_skilled/academics/index.shtm

Interviewing and Evaluating

It is important to remember that the interview visit has a dual purpose: the candidate is being assessed by the search committee; and, the candidate is assessing the department/hospital as a potential place of academic employment. Once the department begins to receive applications for the position, a record of potential candidates should be prepared and reviewed to create a short-list of applicants to be invited for an interview and campus/hospital visit. The goal is to find the best candidate for the position. In preparation for the interview, the search committee should organize a set of questions that assesses the applicants against the selection criteria. Prior to the interview, the chair of the search committee should decide on the order of questions and allocate specific questions to each committee member. At the beginning of the interview, the search committee chair should introduce the applicant to each of the members and take the time to explain the purpose and structure of the interview. The

search committee chair is responsible for ensuring that candidates are not asked questions that could be considered discriminatory (for example, those relating to the individual's marital or family status, gender, nationality, religion, health or physical ability), and that sufficient information is obtained from the candidates for an accurate decision to be made. Before concluding the interview, the candidate should be allowed to ask questions and/or provide information that may not have emerged in response to the core questions. After the interview, committee members should be encouraged to complete their assessment on the candidate.

If a candidate is currently not eligible to work in Canada, the hospital or research institute is responsible for handling all immigration matters.

College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario [CPSO] Documentation for International Education

In order to work in Ontario, international medical graduates who obtain a clinical (MD) academic appointment require an academic certificate of registration with the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario (CPSO). The university department liaises with the faculty HR office and Clinical Affairs to complete the necessary documents to obtain medical licensing in Ontario.

ADDITIONAL SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION

The Chair's letter to the Dean should contain the following information on the search:

- a clear statement that a formal search has occurred
- a list of all members of the search committee and the identity, rank and department of the University of Toronto representative
- a list of the advertising sites/locations and at least one copy of a broad reaching advertisement
- the number of candidates that were interviewed and a brief summary of the rationale for the selection of the successful candidate. Any known demographic information of the candidates (i.e. number of Canadians, number of men and women, etc.) should also be included in the Chair's letter